Leveraging Commitment Theory to Increase Female Representation and Retain Talent

by

Colonel Susan Coyle
Australian Army

Under the Direction of:
Professor Craig Bullis

United States Army War College
Class of 2017

COPYRIGHT STATEMENT:
The author is not an employee of the United States government. Therefore, this document may be protected by copyright law.

The views expressed herein are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the official policy or position of the Department of the Army, Department of Defense, or the U.S. Government. The U.S. Army War College is accredited by the Commission on Higher Education of the Middle States Association of Colleges and Schools, an institutional accrediting agency recognized by the U.S. Secretary of Education and the Council for Higher Education Accreditation.
1. REPORT DATE (DD-MM-YYYY) 01-04-2017
2. REPORT TYPE STRATEGY RESEARCH PROJECT
3. DATES COVERED (From - To)

4. TITLE AND SUBTITLE Leveraging Commitment Theory to Increase Female Representation and Retain Talent

5a. CONTRACT NUMBER
5b. GRANT NUMBER
5c. PROGRAM ELEMENT NUMBER
5d. PROJECT NUMBER
5e. TASK NUMBER
5f. WORK UNIT NUMBER

6. AUTHOR(S) Colonel Susan Coyle Australian Army

7. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) Professor Craig Bullis

8. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION REPORT NUMBER

9. SPONSORING/MONITORING AGENCY NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) U.S. Army War College, 122 Forbes Avenue, Carlisle, PA 17013

10. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S ACRONYM(S)
11. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S REPORT NUMBER(S)

12. DISTRIBUTION / AVAILABILITY STATEMENT Distribution A: Approved for Public Release. Distribution is Unlimited. To the best of my knowledge this SRP accurately depicts USG and/or DoD policy & contains no classified information or aggregation of information that poses an operations security risk. Author: ☒ PA: ☒

13. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES Word Count: 7,525

14. ABSTRACT The Chief of the Australian Army has set a goal of increasing the female representation rate from 12.1 percent to 15 percent by 2023, with the ultimate goal of 25 percent female representation longer term. This paper will use Meyer and Allen's Three-Component Organizational Commitment Model to analyze how to develop and retain talent in high potential female officers in the Australian Army. This analysis will compare data with other nations attending Army War College, information obtained from Defence reports, and survey data from Australian Army female soldiers and officers. The primary recommendation is that the Australian Army use organizational commitment models to better understand the issue, which is a critical prerequisite to effective action. The paper also recommends analysis on why women leave in greater numbers than men, and recommends the establishment of a Talent Management Strategy focused on retention of high potential female officers within the Australian Army.

15. SUBJECT TERMS High Potential, Retention, Gender, Diversity, Organizational Commitment

16. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF:
a. REPORT UU
b. ABSTRACT UU
c. THIS PAGE UU

17. LIMITATION OF ABSTRACT UU

18. NUMBER OF PAGES 39

19a. NAME OF RESPONSIBLE PERSON
19b. TELEPHONE NUMBER (w/ area code)
Leveraging Commitment Theory to Increase Female Representation and Retain Talent (7,525 words)

Abstract

The Chief of the Australian Army has set a goal of increasing the female representation rate from 12.1 percent to 15 percent by 2023, with the ultimate goal of 25 percent female representation longer term. This paper will use Meyer and Allen’s Three-Component Organizational Commitment Model to analyze how to develop and retain talent in high potential female officers in the Australian Army. This analysis will compare data with other nations attending Army War College, information obtained from Defence reports, and survey data from Australian Army female soldiers and officers. The primary recommendation is that the Australian Army use organizational commitment models to better understand the issue, which is a critical prerequisite to effective action. The paper also recommends analysis on why women leave in greater numbers than men, and recommends the establishment of a Talent Management Strategy focused on retention of high potential female officers within the Australian Army.
Leveraging Commitment Theory to Increase Female Representation and Retain Talent

Commitment binds an individual to the organization.
—J. P. Meyer and N. J. Allen

Two key structural forces currently fuel the war for talent: the first is that the power has shifted from the organization to the individual, allowing talented individuals to have negotiating leverage to manage their career. The second is that talent management has become a crucial source of competitive advantage. Recruiting and retention in the twenty-first century is expected to be more challenging with millennial “job-hopping” being the new norm. Global dynamics are changing, experienced baby boomers are retiring, and therefore, to remain competitive, organizations must develop focused strategies to recruit and keep talented individuals. The Australian Army, too, must develop a long-term strategy that better focuses their ability to attract, hire, develop and retain talent across the entire available workforce – of which half are women. Talent refers to those “individuals who can make a difference to organizational performance, either through their immediate contribution, or in the longer term by demonstrating the highest levels of potential.”

In the last sixty years, the Australian Army has confronted major positive changes in the composition of its personnel and organizational structure, to the point where both men and women complete identical training at every level and are able to be employed across all trades and corps. The Australian Army has focused on targeted recruitment and retention efforts, and has introduced initiatives such as women, peace and security policies, as well as equity, diversity and unconscious bias training. However, one could argue that such efforts provide limited statistical success as female
and minority representation and retention remains low, despite deliberate attempts to raise the same. Diversity in the military remains an existential reality, as the organization’s continued capability and success relies on cultivating a committed and diverse workforce with an inclusive culture that is a reflection of society.

The Chief of the Australian Army, Lieutenant General Angus Campbell, along with the other Australian Defence Force Service Chiefs, has set a female representation target of 15% to be achieved by 2023, but has also charged the Army with a longer term follow-on goal of 25%. The Australian Army currently has 12.1% female representation. While the problem is very clear, solutions toward achieving increased female representation are complex, and potentially raise second and third order consequences due to the key tensions between operational requirements at the organizational level, and an individual’s desire to find a balance with family.

To achieve the Chief of Army’s goal will require changing the current strategic narrative, along with a significant focus and effort in addressing both recruitment and retention. Facilitating this expansion was the decision by then Australian Defence Minister Stephen Smith announced in September 2011, that women would be allowed to serve in frontline combat roles by 2016. The Australian Defence Force remains committed to the development of strategies that will attract, recruit and retain Australian service personnel, and in particular from less represented sections such as women and minorities. Women became eligible to apply for all positions other than Special Forces roles in the Australian Army from January 1, 2013; with all remaining restrictions removed following the determination of physical employment standards required for service in all units. These changes have enabled the Australian Army to accommodate
the total force and maintain minimum standards regardless of gender. Since late 2016 women have been able to be directly recruited into all positions, including frontline combat positions.

This paper will outline an option that provides insight to focus the actions of the Australian Army towards achieving an increase in female participation in accordance with senior leaders’ directives. Specifically, this paper will use international comparison and other survey data to better understand the climate for accession and retention of high potential women in the Australian Army.\(^7\) The paper then applies a theory of organizational commitment to better understand the nuances and motivations to both join and remain a member of the Australian Army. Such insights help senior leaders better understand the nature of the challenges in achieving their goals and orients their behavior to have the most positive impact.

**An External Comparison**

In an attempt to begin to understand the climate for the accession and retention of high potential women in the Australian Army, this paper will use qualitative assessment to analyze the current environment. Before exploring the details of Australia’s challenges, strategic leaders should investigate the success of other nations in integrating women into their military formations. The author collected data of female participation from the seventy-one nations represented at the United States Army War College resident class of 2017.\(^8\) At 12.1%, the Australian Army sits above the NATO and partner nation average of 10.8% for nations represented at the War College.\(^9\) Though Israel has the highest figures with 33%, this is due to mandatory service and as a result their numbers significantly drop once this three-year obligation has been completed. Of the remaining nation’s Army representation, Malaysia takes the lead on
16.3% (with 21.6% officers and 10.8% other ranks), closely followed by India on 16%, Lithuania on 15%, the U.S. on 14.7%, Canada on 14.5%, and New Zealand on 13%.

Informed by these international comparisons, the Australian Army faces a significant but realistic challenge to grow from 12.1% to achieve the goal of 15% within the next seven years. Before providing options to increase female participation and retain talent in the Australian Army, it is necessary to provide a brief overview of the key challenges within the Australian Army.

Challenges within the Australian Army

In 2016, female representation within the Australian Army was 12.1%, significantly lower than the Royal Australian Air Force and Royal Australian Navy counterparts whose figures were 19.2% and 19.1% respectively. This data might suggest that the Australian Army, in particular, must tackle unique difficulties not faced by the other services. While there are a number of challenges facing the Australian Army more broadly, there are two in particular which are critical to increasing female representation and retaining talent: recruitment and retention. Each are considered in turn.

Recruitment

The Australian Army is recruiting more women and is more diverse than ever before in their history. However, unless sufficient numbers of women are recruited each year, the services will be unable to grow enough to demonstrate a reflection of society throughout the ranks. To illustrate, the Australian Defence Force only met 57.5% of the Army, 79.1% of Navy and 71.2% of Air Force’s female recruiting targets in 2015-16. A collegiate joint approach with the Royal Australian Navy and Royal Australian Air Force will be essential if the Australian Defence Force is to increase female representation.
Noting the goal of 15% female representation, only two occupational groups within the Australian Army currently have female representation at 15% or higher, compared with three or four groups for the Royal Australian Navy and Royal Australian Air Force respectively (see Figure 1). These include stereotypical traditional corps: health, whose officers represent 44.7%; and logistics, administration and support, whose officers represent 26.1%. Close to the target, currently at 14% include communications, intelligence and surveillance corps, and senior officers currently comprise 12.7%. The lowest occupational group was combat and security where females represent only 1.7% - though this is expected to change now that the Australian Army has opened these positions to women. Analysis of the percentage of women by occupational group shows that potential Army growth areas where a focus could be in the specializations of logistics, administration and support, and communications, intelligence and surveillance; particularly when comparing with Air Force and Navy figures which are considerably higher.
Before all corps were open to women, the military warrior ethos asserted that most uniformed men served in unusually dangerous or arduous jobs. The reality is that modern-day Army’s “tooth-to-tail” ratio shows that it is not only combat troops, but also traditional support roles who now fulfil this image on the modern-day battlefield. If you were to remove the Combat and Security occupation statistics, which currently
represents almost a third of the Australian Army from the overall female representation, the figure increases to 17.1%, therefore achieving the overall 15% desired target; arguably a more realistic figure of women’s representation within the Army given that it has only been very recently that all corps have allowed women to serve. Women should be strongly encouraged and supported to serve in any corps, however, similarly with the introduction of women into the Australian Army many decades earlier, there will be leadership and cultural challenges to assimilating women into combat positions which have been traditionally the remit of a male domain.

There was strong evidence of successful integration when viewing comparison data with other nations represented at the War College, with many nations successfully employing women within combat corps in their militaries. Several nations are employing as high as 20% female representation within combat and security occupation positions, for example, 12.5% of women in NATO nations are employed in the Infantry.¹⁴

Retention

Retention of women figures provides a current challenge to the Australian Army, with the top reason why men and women have left Defence in the past two years being “to make a career change while still young enough,” with “low morale within their work environment” and “issues with day-to-day unit management of personnel matters” closely following.¹⁵ This is aligned with other nation’s findings, such as the NATO nations identifying that 33% of both men and women leave their service due to the “difficulty balancing work and family commitments.”¹⁶

While work has commenced within training establishments to include “understanding how adolescent brains work, and how women learn and interact,” the retention figures at training establishments across the Australian Defence Force are of
concern.\textsuperscript{17} For example, only 50\% of the forty-eight initial entry females selected for Army officer training at the Australian Defence Force Academy completed the course in financial year 2015-16 (though it should also be noted that only 55\% of the Army men completed the course); ample justification that further investigation is warranted. Male and female statistics at Army officer training are both significantly lower than compared to regular Army soldier training, and Navy or Air Force training establishment equivalents. Of the twenty-four women who did not complete Army officer training, nine failed the course, nine discharged at own request and six were withdrawn for medical or compassionate reasons.\textsuperscript{18}

The retention rate of women traditionally also falls significantly below that for men following the initial service obligation period, with women's rolling separation rates by age being slightly higher than men across each of the Australian Defence Force's three services, and within every rank group in the past twelve months, with an average separation rate of 8.6\% for women compared with 8.3\% for men (see Figure 2).\textsuperscript{19} The Australian Army's statistics are even less positive, with 11\% of women separating, compared with 9.9\% of men, and the highest proportion being female soldiers exiting at 12.2\%.\textsuperscript{20} These statistics for both the training and trained force show that further analysis into these statistics may yield chances to retain some individuals.
The other factor is that future senior officer ranks will become diverse only if there is a concerted effort to provide the environment for retaining high potential women, and ensuring that promotion opportunities exist. Without further analysis, current statistics do not bode well to achieve the Chief of the Army’s challenge to increase female representation, or assist in an effort to retain talent. For example, another area from which further analysis may be useful is to understand why the Australian Army’s median time in service is lower for men and women, and why Australian Army women are significantly lower than their Air Force and Navy counterparts (see Figure 3).
Finally, realizing that the Australian Army's problem was unstructured and complex, the author wanted to get a more nuanced perspective from women on why women chose to join, stay or leave the Australian Army. The author posed a series of questions to 50 females, ranging in rank from private to brigadier in the Australian Army. Those surveyed were invited to answer the following questions:

- What reason(s) caused them to join the military?
- Reasons that they have stayed?
- What would cause them to consider leaving, or if they know other women who left the military, what was the principle reason(s) that caused them to leave?
- Whether they think that women are tougher on other women in terms of standards and expectations, and why?
- Whether they consider themselves mentors for other women and what that relationship provides them?
While it is recognized that the survey was a convenience sample, after reviewing each of the responses, the results highlighted several themes as to why women joined, stayed or considered leaving the Australian Army. Unequivocally, women joined the Australian Army because of a calling to service, many had family in the service and/or were attracted to the challenges offered. Many acknowledged that serving in the Australian Army provided an opportunity for job security and for further education.

The responses were equally revealing as to why women stayed in the Australian Army—which was predominantly because of the people, with many expressing that they valued working with high-functioning and motivated people. Many were able to relate to the sense of belonging to a community and the pride in serving their nation. They felt they were being challenged and that there was a variety of jobs available. They also expressed an attraction to the good pay, as well as ample training and education opportunities they received by staying in the Australian Army.

The final theme to emerge from the surveys was that women would consider leaving if they felt they were no longer able to meaningfully contribute to the organization. This was due to dissatisfaction within their working environment, and in particular due to their perception of discrimination and poor treatment of women. Many of the more junior ranks identified that they would consider leaving if standards were being lowered to accommodate women. Other factors included a lack of career advancement, being placed into a position where their work compromised their ability to care for their family, poor work/life balance, and dissatisfaction with their posting location.
With an understanding of the problem and the background to increasing female participation, as well as an overview of challenges facing the Australian Army from a recruiting and retention perspective, this paper will now outline an option which, if implemented, may provide a better foundation to achieving the Chief of Army’s challenge to increase female participation to 15% by 2023. Unless there is a change to the current status quo, the slow glacier-like pace of female representation will continue to rise but only slightly, and arguably not enough to achieve the Chief of Army’s stated goal.

An Option—Organizational Commitment

An important aspect of individual decision-making is the type and degree of commitment experienced by individuals, and therefore the “lens” of organizational commitment provides a reasonable perspective to both understand the Chief of Army’s challenge and inform a way ahead. This research proposes considering the use of Meyer and Allen’s Three-Component Organizational Commitment Model as the framework to illustrate the benefits of organizational commitment to the Australian Army. By understanding when and how commitments develop and how they can help shape attitudes and behaviors, organizations will be in a better position to anticipate changes and manage their organization more effectively. Meyer and Allen’s Model can focus and orient senior leader action in nuanced ways. This section will first define Meyer and Allen’s Three-Component Organizational Commitment Model before describing each of the three sub-components and associated research outcomes, before linking to challenges to the Australian Army in achieving increased female representation target of 15% by 2023.
Commitment and Organizational Commitment Definitions

Before defining the model, it is important to define what both commitment and organizational commitment means in order to incorporate organizational commitment in approaching the Australian Army’s challenge. Commitment is viewed as reflecting an affective orientation toward the organization, a recognition of costs associated with leaving the organization, and a moral obligation to remain with the organization. Commitment is a multifaceted construct, in particular how it develops, and what are its implications for employees and for their organizations.

Meyer and Allen assert that the common definition for organizational commitment is “the view that commitment is a psychological state that characterizes the employee’s relationship with the organization, and has implications for the decision to continue membership within the organization.” Proposed over thirty years ago, organizational commitment generally implies an attachment to the organization as a whole, including feelings of loyalty and pride as well as shared values. It is “the relative strength of an individual’s identification with and involvement in a particular organization.” Organizational commitment identifies three subcomponents: a strong belief in and acceptance of the organization’s goals and values, a willingness to exert considerable effort on behalf of the organization, and a strong desire to remain in the organization. All definitions hone in on the aspects of desire, need and obligation, and are relevant and directly applicable to the Australian Army.

Overview of Subcomponents

Meyer and Allen’s Three-Component Organizational Commitment Model postulates that an employee is able to simultaneously experience different commitment to the organization based on an emotional attachment (affective commitment), high
social or economic cost perceptions of leaving the organization (continuance commitment), and finally a feeling of obligation toward the organization (normative commitment), as shown in Figure 4.

Figure 4. Meyer and Allen’s Three-Component Organizational Commitment Model

Meyer and Allen’s model describes three individual constructs of organizational commitment which should be viewed as distinguishable subcomponents, as employees are able to experience each of these psychological states to varying degrees simultaneously or individually. Meyer and Allen assert that this research will stand to gain a clearer understanding of an employee’s relationship with an organization by considering the strength of all three forms of commitment together, than through classifying it as being of a particular type. The extent of the impact of these three components on organizational commitment relies upon an individual’s motivation for
growth and self-actualization in the organization. Each of the three subcomponents of Meyer and Allen’s model will now be defined, and research outcomes for each subcomponent will be provided to enable the linking to the nature of the problem—an assessment on how each subcomponent of organizational commitment model challenges the Australian Army to achieve the goal of increased female participation and retention of talent in the Australian Army.

Affective Commitment

The first subcomponent of Meyer and Allen’s model is affective commitment, which is an individual desire by an employee normally brought about by an emotional attachment to, identification with, and a belief in its values. Employees with a strong affective commitment feel a strong emotional attachment to the organization, and therefore they will have a greater motivation or desire to meaningfully contribute. Employees with a strong affective commitment remain with an organization because they want to do so.

Research Outcomes Supporting Affective Commitment

There are several definitions of commitment which relate to affective orientation, with Kanter asserting that it is the attachment of “an individual's fund of affectivity and emotion to the group.” Research shows that a primary reason people leave companies is due to a lack of personal growth and job challenge opportunities. Affective commitment has a positive correlation with job challenge, degree of autonomy, and variety of skills that an employee uses. Further, significant research shows that affective commitment is strongest where there are clear roles, and that role ambiguity and role conflict are minimized.
Google’s secret to ranking in the top five most admired companies in America to work for, is not because of their complimentary chef-graded meals or access to athletic facilities, but because their organization encourages a commitment to work in an environment that “fosters positive emotions, strong internal motivation, and favorable perceptions of colleagues and the work itself.” Research has shown that it is not better human resource processes that make a difference, but the mindset of leaders throughout organizations in the importance of talent that make the difference.

A critical process in the development of affective commitment is the fulfilment of personal needs. An employee who is satisfied that their needs, expectations and goals can be attained are more likely to develop a strong affective commitment to the organization. Research also shows that women generally value relationships and connectedness with others to such a great extent that they will often sacrifice their needs for others, which presents the Australian Army a potential retention challenge when there is misalignment. This is illustrated by the fact that fewer than 25% of employees take advantage of flexible work arrangements or long leave absences for fear of being penalized and hurting their careers, an important issue as those companies who have a larger uptake in flexible work arrangements report that they have a better representation of women in their ranks.

Research indicates that women receive less access to senior leaders, which may be compounded by differences in professional networks, as women are more likely to rely on a network that is mostly female. As more men hold senior positions, fewer women have access to people who are able to influence their future.
Affective Commitment Challenges in the Australian Army

In order for the Australian Army to maximize affective commitment to the organizational outcomes, they must follow Google’s example and foster the right environment. Google’s employees reflect an affective commitment to their organization, and their secret to amazing performance is empowering talented people to succeed at meaningful work.\textsuperscript{50} Two areas that the Australian Army should consider to improve affective commitment include the provision of a clear communications strategy by the Chief of the Army, and consideration of specific talent management functions to enhance female participation within Army.

Central to all efforts is the importance of the Australian Army’s Senior Leadership Group, who play a critical role and are involved in all strategic leadership decisions.\textsuperscript{51} From the definition of affective commitment, it is understood that it necessarily involves a desire in individuals to be a part of an organization because of shared goals and values and therefore the manner in which organizational policy is communicated within the Australian Army will be critical to enhancing affective commitment.\textsuperscript{52} Within the Army, it is critical that the Chief of Army and his Senior Leadership Group are able to change the strategic narrative, by defining and articulating a clear vision on who constitutes the Army, where the Army wants to go, and what success will look like with an increase in female representation. It is insufficient to merely state that you require 15% women by 2023, without an effective vision statement which reflects the leaders’ intentions.\textsuperscript{53} How was the long-term figure of 25% selected, and what happens if that figure reaches only 20%? In order to influence an employee’s level of commitment, organizations must influence their perceptions, as these play an important role in the development of employee’s commitment to the organization.\textsuperscript{54}
The Australian Army can learn from Google as they focus on increasing the female representation rate of women, with emphasis not just on accoutrements and better uniforms which have resulted from recent positive policies changes, but also greater emphasis on the work itself. Job challenge is an area where the Army can make immediate improvements to retain talent for those working full time, but also for those who work part-time or take time off for personal reasons such as childbirth. There must be a careful selection of female high potential officers into clear roles and positions that provide job challenge, and allow individuals to fully utilize their skills.

To achieve this, the Senior Leadership Group within the Australian Army must develop a talent mindset, understanding that talent management can’t be delegated. Leaders with a talent mindset have the “passion, courage, and determination to take the bold actions necessary to strengthen their talent pools.” The Army must hire quality individuals who meet standardized requirements and promote individuals based on merit and potential. In an effort to align goals and values with high potential women, the Australian Army can influence affective commitment by providing a better support framework to support these women’s motivation to remain serving, such as the establishment of a dedicated career advisor; who should manage high potential women and men. The issue of support was raised during the surveys, where women felt they were placed into a predicament where work conflicted with their responsibility to their families, leaving many with no alternate options but to consider leaving. While all organizations ask sacrifice of its members, one of the unique challenges to women is the social construct, as in most Western societies it is more socially acceptable for men to sacrifice their families.
Mentoring will assist with job satisfaction which should increase affective commitment, as research has shown that job satisfaction was the only significant variable associated with commitment to military service—with good pay, learning valuable skills, and pleasant physical surroundings (listed in order of importance) identified as the most important components of job satisfaction.\textsuperscript{57} Research has shown that women who develop mentoring relationships have been shown to achieve greater success and progress in their careers than those who do not, as mentors are able to build a mentee’s self-confidence, and provide essential career guidance and direction.\textsuperscript{58} This guidance can assist to find future employment opportunities which can enhance a woman’s visibility within the organization, and potentially inform succession planning.

The functions provided by a dedicated career advisor would enhance job satisfaction by ensuring that there is deliberate engagement with high potentials, and in particular to ensure the pairing with a mentor in an effort to retain talent. Critical to their development is for high potentials to be consulted regarding their job assignments and development plans, ensuring greater ownership and affective commitment to their development and assisting to achieve work life balance.\textsuperscript{59}

In order to raise female representation in non-traditional employment groups, such as combat and security specializations where the representation remains in single digits, the use of mentors may be an incredibly powerful tool. Utilizing senior officers as mentors for high potential women encourages organizational commitment, and may have the additional benefit of providing supported opportunities to transfer high potential women into non-traditional occupational groups. When one is mentored, particularly by
senior members of the organization, they feel greater attachment and commitment to their employers.60

Utilizing a talent mindset and articulating a clear vision, the Australian Army’s Senior Leadership Group can improve the affective commitment of its high potential women by assisting women to develop a strong attachment to the organization. This will enable women to engender an enhanced motivation as they will be able to meaningfully contribute. This can be further enhanced by utilizing the concepts of side bets and alternatives within the second of Meyer and Allen’s subcomponents--continuance commitment.

Continuance Commitment

While some people are attached to organizations because of shared values, others are attracted to organizations simply because of the cost / benefit calculation. Meyer and Allen capture this notion in their second organizational commitment subcomponent--continuance commitment.

Continuance commitment is identified by an individual’s need to remain in an organization, and is normally brought about by an awareness of any perceived costs associated with leaving the organization. An employee may be committed to an employer because they believe that they are paid well and feel that it would hurt their family to quit.61 Employees whose primary link to the organization is based on continuance commitment remain because they need to do so.62 Continuance commitment to an organization develops as a function of the “investments” that an employee makes and the employment alternatives that they believe to exist.63
There are several definitions of commitment which relate to cost-based orientation found in continuance commitment. Kanter asserts that it is the profit associated with continued participation and a “cost” associated with leaving.64 Research shows that organizational commitment is highest when people perceive their work environments more positively, such as encouragement from their team leaders and support from their teammates as well as managers and co-workers outside of their team.65 Development is critical to attracting and retaining people, and therefore high potentials will be more inclined to leave if they feel that are not growing and stretching.66

Developing an Employee Value Proposition will be essential to stem high potentials from planning to leave an organization. An Employee Value Proposition is the holistic sum of an individual’s experiences, including their intrinsic satisfaction of the work due to the environment, leadership, colleagues, and compensation.67 Research clearly supports this, showing that managers who feel that their companies develop them poorly are five times more likely to leave than people who feel that their companies develop them well.68

Research and survey responses all showed that families are important for a service members’ retention and readiness.69 A major stressor for women (and men) in the military is the continued requirement to relocate, family separations particularly due to lengthy deployments, and endeavoring to allow their partners to have a career as well. Retention will improve if the military allows greater flexibility in career assignments to accommodate family circumstances. Again, research and survey responses show that women are stoic in that they do not want or expect changes that would interfere with their unit’s performance and readiness, but more can be done to support high
potential women. Simple measures such as encouraging practices that better accommodate families (e.g., extending childcare and avoiding clearly unnecessary off-hours duties) would assist retention and increase affective and normative commitment for all groups as they would feel more valued and may exhibit a sense of obligation. Such accommodations could result in higher morale, readiness and organizational commitment for both men and women.

**Continuance Commitment Challenges in the Australian Army**

In order for the Australian Army to maximize continuance commitment to the organization, they should endeavor to gain a deeper understanding of the triggers as to why women leave the organization. In order to develop continuance commitment in the Army’s high potential females, it is imperative that they focus on the individual development needs of each high potential, which can be achieved through side bets and alternatives. The first aspect, side bets, includes those actions that link a person to a particular course of action by virtue of the fact that something would be forfeited if they discontinued the activity. In the case of Army, this can be reinforced through the functions offered by a dedicated career advisor which would create an open dialogue for succession planning for high potentials, therefore ensuring that talented individuals are involved in their career decision-making and afforded opportunities for progression.

The second aspect relates to alternatives, which suggests that if individuals believe that they have multiple alternatives to their current employment, their continuance commitment will be low. This can be addressed within the Australian Army through a greater awareness of high potentials’ intentions, and by offering alternate options to include different career paths within the Army. Development is central to increasing continuance commitment, ensuring that through a series of stretch jobs,
coaching and mentoring, high potential females should assess the cost benefit to remain in the service as more favorable. It is expected that the first issue will start to change over time as women are now able to be employed across increased career opportunities, thus providing unlimited opportunities for career advancement. Consistent messaging and support by the Australian Army’s strategic leaders will be critical to change the strategic narrative to counter the beliefs expressed by many women that their role in the military may not be fully accepted, let alone the appropriateness of women in combat roles. Further analysis, utilizing lessons learnt from other nations who have successfully integrated all positions and emerging research, will assist the Australian Army to avoid repeating lessons learnt by other nations. This will provide a systematic, long-term approach to meeting the present and future talent needs of an organization to continue to achieve its mission and strategic objectives.

Career demands, particularly impacting on family generally increase as individuals progress in rank, which would be a contributing factor to the perception that women are less likely than men to achieve higher ranks. Family constraints tend to impinge on women’s choices, regardless of concerted attempts to prevent gender from negatively impacting women’s military careers. Survey responses alluded to women “falling off the radar” when they took a period of maternity or long service leave. This is supported by the U.S. Secretary of Navy’s statement that “women are forced to choose
between serving their country or their family.” Research leaning towards women choosing to “opt out” of their careers is also supported by the survey responses, citing women’s career decisions are due in a large part to “a reaction to outdated work structures, policies, and cultures that do not fit their lives.” While it can be expected that there will be a portion of the workplace where a non-traditional workforce would be problematic, lateral thinking is essential if Army is to identify new opportunities to retain high potentials. This could be achieved through the development of a “psychological contract” between the organization and the individual through mentoring, which would enable high potential women to receive something in return for the investment.

Introducing an Employee Value Proposition and ensuring that, through the career advisor and mentors, high potential women are able to use side bets and alternatives will enable the Australian Army to address continuance commitment to increase female participation and retain talent. This can be further enhanced by addressing the obligation factor which is detailed in the final subcomponent of Meyer and Allen’s subcomponents—normative commitment.

Normative Commitment

This paper has shown opportunities and challenges arising from an individual’s attachment to their organization because of shared values present in affective commitment, and the cost/benefit analysis of leaving shown in continuance commitment. Meyer and Allen capture an equally important challenge, which is the attachment of obligation to an organization through their final subcomponent—*normative commitment*.

Normative commitment is identified by an individual’s sense or feelings of obligation towards the organization to continue employment, and is normally based on
moral or ethical reasons. Employees with a strong or high level of normative commitment remain with the organization because they have a strong sense that they ought to do so.

**Research Outcomes Supporting Normative Commitment**

There are several definitions of commitment which relate to obligation or moral responsibility found in normative commitment. Marsh and Mannari assert that the committed employee considers it morally right to stay in the company, regardless of how much status enhancement or satisfaction is given over the years. A significant aspect which impacts normative commitment (and continuance commitment) is the challenge of balancing family and careers. Segal discusses the “greedy” nature of family/household responsibilities and the equally “greedy” nature a career demands. When the demands of both are incompatible, it may be that socialization of women to meet family demands over career pushes them out of the workforce.

Critical to enhancing normative commitment will be a focus by commanders to ensure that selected high potentials do not feel stigmatized by their association with the policy. Empirical research clearly demonstrates the negative effect on attitudes of both men and women towards female beneficiaries of affirmative action policies, suggesting that diversity goals can also negatively influence perceptions of beneficiaries’ competence. For example, research shows that white males have perceived affirmative action as reverse discrimination against them, often on behalf of unqualified minorities and women. For their part, minorities and women perceive that affirmative action stigmatizes “qualified” minorities and women who would have been hired on their own merits, and compromises their credibility and ability to move up the organizational ladder.
Normative Commitment Challenges in the Australian Army

In order for the Australian Army to maximize normative commitment to the organization they must focus on the role that women play as a part of the Profession of Arms. Military service is synonymous with sacrifice which requires an exceptional level of commitment, and therefore it is expected that there will be periods of separation from family, frequent relocations to meet service-driven needs and the rigors of training and deployments; however there are also opportunities that allow for flexibility, which can enhance normative commitment which may assist in improving the Australian Army’s poor retention rates. Poor retention is evidence of a lack of normative commitment, and undermines the Chief of Army’s ability to increase female participation and retain talent.

Strategic messaging by the Senior Leadership Group within the Army will be critical to embracing a talent mindset. It is important that the plan is clearly articulated so that it is a natural and evolutionary process, and is not perceived as pushing a progressive agenda that imposes affirmative action or social change on the military. Another option to increase normative commitment is for the senior leadership to utilize leader-member exchange theory by identifying selected high potential women to bring into their “in-group,” which research shows results in higher performance, less turnover and greater job satisfaction.

Each of the three services within the Australian Defence Force has currently invested personnel and energy to improve recruitment figures. For example, the Australian Army embedded ten specialist female soldiers to be recruiters at Australian Defence Force Recruiting units in 2013, and these positions have since been extended until 2025. To take this to the next level, it is proposed that a high potential female officer from any of the three services are placed into each of the sixteen recruitment
centers around Australia. Utilizing high potential women within Defence Force Recruiting will enable the organization to personalize the attraction and recruitment process through the use of strong, successful and motivated role models. This will communicate a message that these women are a part of something that is greater than themselves. It also sends a message to those women selected to work within Recruiting that they are valued, which will also enhance their normative commitment to the organization.

Recommendations

A number of actionable recommendations have been derived from the analysis of the three distinct constructs of organizational commitment, which if implemented may contribute to increased female representation, and retention of high potential women in the Australian Army:

Formal Assessment Using a Commitment Framework

The first recommendation is for the Australian Army to use Meyer and Allen’s Three-Component Organizational Commitment Model, as was used in the present study, to conduct a formal assessment of commitment within the Army. Meyer and Allen’s model can focus and orient senior leader action in nuanced ways. It is envisaged that better understanding an employee’s relationship with their organization will have the second-order effect of increasing the representation and retention of women in the Australian Army. As the analysis has shown, this model is a sophisticated and comprehensive way to understand the issue, and such understanding is critical to focus effective action. Informed by the formal assessment of organizational commitment in the Australian Army, will also enable the Australian Army to conduct detailed analysis to understand why women leave in higher numbers during initial training and throughout
their career. This will ensure that mechanisms to address these issues are identified and implemented.

**Mentors**

As mentoring theoretically influences both affective and continuance commitment, the second recommendation is to allocate senior leaders as formal mentors for each high potential officer, and introduce high potential female officers as formal mentors to candidates selected during the recruitment process. Mentors would enable the embedding mechanism to improve organizational culture. Mentoring would provide a better idea of options within the service that enables high potential officers to obtain realistic job choices. Utilizing high potential officers at every recruitment center enhances the strategic narrative by taking the benefits of affective and continuance commitment into society, and encourages high potential female officers to continue to serve.

**Senior Leader Communication**

The third recommendation is for the Australian Army’s senior leaders to focus on strategic messaging by clearly communicating a vision towards achieving increased female participation by demonstrating values-based and innovative messages. A change management strategy tailored for commanders and senior soldiers across the organization will be critical to implementing strategic messaging from the Senior Leadership Group. This needs to be focused throughout recruiting, basic training, and across the organization to maximize retention. Emphasis must be placed on the fact that being in the Australian Army is being a part of the Profession of Arms, it is about “Service.”
Establish a Talent Management Strategy Mindset

The final recommendation is to establish a Talent Management Strategy mindset within Army focused on high potential officers (men and women), commencing from recruitment and initial entry until discharge. The primary purpose of developing leadership talent is to support an organization to meet its strategic goals. A Talent Management Strategy would provide a reinforcing mechanism which would enable a comprehensive set of activities, such as Employee Value Proposition and Development Plans, to ensure that the Australian Defence Force can attract, retain, motivate and develop the high potential people that it needs now and into the future. This will include the requirement to introduce a dedicated career advisor function for all high potential officers. Critical to its success will be the leadership and involvement by not only the Australian Army’s senior leaders, but commanders at all levels.

Limitations of the Research

This research has focused on the importance of organizational commitment towards increasing female participation rates within the Australian Army, and specifically focused on high potential women, though the findings and recommendations could be equally applied to high potential men. A thorough evaluation of the recommendations is beyond the scope of this paper; however, each recommendation is worthy of further consideration if it will enable the Australian Army to achieve the desired 15% representation of women by 2023 as expressly desired by the Chief of Army with the longer term goal of 25%. All recommendations need to be integrated with strategic workforce planners to ensure, when designing what jobs will need to be performed by soldiers in the future, that they are synchronized with future workforce requirements and
incorporate lessons learnt from other nations in increasing female representation within their militaries.

It should also be noted that there are also other forms of commitments that people develop, such as an individual’s commitment to their work group, manager or profession, as well as commitments outside of work which may influence organizational commitment and behavior at work,\textsuperscript{90} which could be used to understand the causes for departure of talent within the Australian Army which were not drawn out through this research.

Conclusion

The Australian Army, when compared with international nations represented at the War College, is performing well from a female representation perspective. A review of survey responses from current serving females, and the Australian Defence Force reports, all show that the desire, needs and obligations which may inhibit the retention of our high potentials can be minimized provided there is strong leadership and strategy driven from the top. However, the Australian Army can do better.

The Chief of the Australian Army’s goal to increase the female representation rate to 15% by 2023, and the ultimate goal of 25% female representation longer term will require a new strategic narrative if it is to be realized. There are significant opportunities for the Australian Army which can be learned through the study of organizational commitment. This paper has proposed that utilizing Meyer and Allen’s Three-Component Organizational Commitment Model provides a better understanding of commitment, to better understand the issue which is a critical prerequisite to effective action. This paper has shown that by analyzing the affective, continuance and normative commitment subcomponents within Meyer and Allen’s model, many options
emerge which may contribute to improve the attraction, recruitment and, in particular, retention of Army’s female high potential officers. Analyzing why women are failing in such high numbers during initial training, as well as why women leave in higher numbers, will provide further understanding of the issue, enabling tailored actionable recommendations to be implemented.

If the Australian Army is to achieve a truly diverse workforce with increased female representation and retain its talent, it needs to become more agile, moving beyond affirmative action and stigmatization focused on individuals or groups. It is critical that this strategy is led by the Chief of Army and supported by strong leadership throughout the organization. Utilizing an articulated Talent Management Strategy, to include strong leadership, consistent strategic messaging, dedicated career management, and the benefits of mentors will provide a foundation upon which to focus on the retention and development of high potential women (and men) within Army. Change is essential, and therefore it is concluded that if these options are implemented, the Australian Army should meet their target of 15% female representation by 2023, and be well on their way to achieving 25% by 2025.

Endnotes


5 Ibid., 7.


7 “High potentials” are defined as those talented female officers identified by commanders who “demonstrate the ability to advance at least two or three levels, and who will yield the highest return on the company’s investment in development resources,” quoted in William C. Byham, Audrey B. Smith, and Matthew J. Paese, Grow Your Own Leaders – How to Identify, Develop and Retain Leadership Talent (New Jersey: Prentice-Hall Incorporated, 2002), 61.

8 Seventy One nations are represented in the 2017 United States Army War College Resident Class including: Albania, Armenia, Australia, Bangladesh, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Brazil, Bulgaria, Burkina Faso, Cambodia, Canada, Chad, Chile, Colombia, Democratic Republic of the Congo, Croatia, Czech Republic, Denmark, Djibouti, Egypt, El Salvador, Estonia, Ethiopia, Finland, France, Georgia, Germany, Ghana, Greece, India, Indonesia, Israel, Italy, Jamaica, Japan, Jordan, Korea, Kosovo, Kuwait, Lebanon, Lithuania, Malaysia, Mali, Mongolia, Morocco, Nepal, Netherlands, New Zealand, Nigeria, Norway, Pakistan, Papua New Guinea, Peru, Philippines, Poland, Qatar, Romania, Rwanda, Saudi Arabia, Senegal, Slovak Republic, South Africa, Spain, Taiwan, Tanzania, Togo, Tunisia, Ukraine, United Arab Emirates, United Kingdom, United States, and Vietnam.


10 Of this 12.1%, 16.2% comprise officers and 10.9% comprise other ranks; Australian Department of Defence, Women in the ADF Report 2015-16, 112.

11 Ibid., 10.

12 Ibid., 115.

13 Mary Fainsod Katzenstein and Judith Reppy, Beyond Zero Tolerance: Discrimination in Military Culture (Maryland: Rowman and Littlefield Publishers, 1999), 66.

14 Toriati, Summary of the National Responsibilities of NATO Members and Partner Nations, 23.

15 Australian Department of Defence, Women in the ADF Report 2015-16, 75.

16 Toriati, Summary of the National Responsibilities of NATO Members and Partner Nations, 16.


The information gathered through this informal survey was used to inform the selection of a theoretical model to determine how to attract, recruit and retain women in the Australian Army. The sample of Australian Army women was initially drawn from personal knowledge of women who were employed in key appointments across the Australian Defence Organisation. Then, some of these women shared the author’s request for information with other women within their chain of command. A total of fifty responses were received from women within the Australian Army, these women ranged in rank from private up to and including brigadier. Responses were received utilizing personal email and social media. Using their responses, the author was able to generate the lessons and opportunities referred to within the paper. These lessons and opportunities were then analysed and compared with other data obtained through Australian Defence Force reports. It is acknowledged that convenience sampling was used to garner information to use to use within the paper. There was broad variance within the responses, which was expected given the rank variance and experience differences between those who volunteered to participate. The detailed analysis of the qualitative data was considered to be beyond the scope of this paper, however it has been used to inform the theoretical framework selected. More detailed information on the data is available from the author. The Human Research Determination Form is on file with the Project Advisor.

Meyer and Allen, *Commitment in the Workplace*, 11.

Ibid., ix.

Ibid., 11.

Ibid., viii.

Ibid., 11.


41 Byham, Smith and Paese, *Grow Your Own Leaders*, i.

42 Meyer and Allen, *Commitment in the Workplace*, 45.

43 Ibid.


45 Michaels, Handfield-Jones, and Axelroad, *The War For Talent*, x.

46 Meyer and Allen, *Commitment in the Workplace*, 50.


49 Ibid., 13.

The Senior Leadership Group comprises all one-star ranking officers and above within the Australian Army.

Meyer and Allen, *Commitment in the Workplace*, 43.


Meyer and Allen, *Commitment in the Workplace*, 66.


Meyer and Allen, *Commitment in the Workplace*, 60.

Kanter, “Commitment and Social Organization,” 504.


Ibid., 43.


Hosek et al., *Minority and Gender Differences in Officer Career Progression*, 108.

Meyer and Allen, *Commitment in the Workplace*, 57.

73 Hosek et al., *Minority and Gender Differences in Officer Career Progression*, 100.


79 Meyer and Allen, *Commitment in the Workplace*, 62.


83 Segal, “The Military and the Family as Greedy Institutions.”


88 The Australian Defence Force has sixteen recruiting centers located in Canberra, Newcastle, Parramatta, Wollongong, Albury, Brisbane, Townsville, Cairns, Gold Coast, Maroochydore, Toowoomba, Melbourne, Adelaide, Hobart, Darwin and Perth.


90 Meyer and Allen, *Commitment in the Workplace*, 2.